

CITY OF CHARLESTON BOARD OF ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW – SMALL

PUBLIC COMMENT AUGUST 24, 2023

A meeting of the Board of Architectural Review — Small (BAR-S) will be held on **Thursday**, **August 24**, **2023** at **4:30 p.m.** in the **Public Meeting Room**, **First Floor**, **2 George Street**.

The following written comments will be provided to the board members 24 hours in advance of the meeting. The comments will also be acknowledged into the record and summarized. The public is encouraged to attend the meeting in person to speak in order for comments to be fully heard.

Application information is available at <u>www.charleston-sc.gov/bar</u>. Please check the website on the meeting date to view any withdrawn or deferred agenda items.

For additional information, please contact:

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, PRESERVATION & SUSTAINABILITY 2 George Street, Suite 3100, Charleston, SC 29401 | 843-724-3781

B. APPLICATIONS

1. 426 Sumter Street

TMS # 460-07-01-083 | BAR2023-001199

NS | Westside | c. 1935 | Historic Materials Demolition Purview

Request demolition of all siding, windows, doors, and exterior trim; fenestration changes, and alterations to piazza screen.

Owner: Matt and Traci Kennerknecht

Applicant: Mike Eippert

Site visit on 8/24/2023 at 8:30 a.m.

2. 221 Yates Avenue

TMS # 343-05-00-107, 343-05-00-114 | BAR2023-001200

National Register | c. 1942 | Landmark Overlay

Requesting complete demolition of existing single-family house and detached garage.

Owner: City of Charleston, Parks

Applicant: Matt Compton, Special Projects Administrator

Site visit on 8/24/2023 at 9:20 a.m.

One (1) Comment Submitted:

Neil Sneath, Riverland Terrace
 Submitted Aug. 22, 2023 2:44 PM

On behalf of the Riverland Terrace Neighborhod Association, Please expedite the demolition of the non-historic structures at Fort Pemberton. It has become a haven for vagrant and trespassing issues. The surrounding neighbors continue to be negatively affected and CPD Team 3 resources are depleted every time they have to respond to these nuisance and dangerous issues. Demo of the house, along with proper signage that it's an active construction site, would deter criminal behavior.

3. 1 Trapman Street

TMS # 457-12-01-025 | BAR2023-001201

Category 3 | Harleston Village | c. 1855 | Old and Historic District

Request demolition of rear addition.

Owner: Allie & Joe Brittain
Applicant: AJ Architects

Site visit on 8/24/2023 at 8:50 a.m.

4. 186 St. Philip Street

TMS # 460-12-02-064 | BAR2022-000789

New | Cannonborough/Elliottborough | Old City District

Request revision to final approval for proposed changes to windows and doors of new, three-story, mixed-use building.

Owner: CKC Properties LLC Applicant: AJ Architects

5. 237 Coming Street

TMS # 460-08-03-170 | BAR2023-001202

Category 4 | Cannonborough / Elliottborough | c. 1850 | Old City District

Request conceptual approval for new rear addition.

Owner: Cara Delay & Paris Ballesteros

Applicant: April Magill, Root Down Designs

6. 549 King Street

TMS # 460-12-02-076 | BAR2023-001203

Category 3 | Cannonborough / Elliottborough | c. 1900 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval for two-story rear addition.

Owner: Shelbourne Properties 549, LLC

Applicant: Neil Stevenson

7. 11 Lowndes Street

TMS # 457-11-02-084 | BAR2023-001146

NS | Charlestowne | Old and Historic District

Requesting conceptual approval for new two and a half single family home and renovation of existing historic garage.

Owner: Mitchell and Debra Sonkin

Applicant: Sebastian von Marschall Architect, LLC

as agent for John B. Murray Architects, Ilc, NYC

Two (2) Comments Submitted:

• Carol Kelly, 16 Gibbes Street

Submitted Aug. 23, 2023 11:57 AM

I am very concerned about the size and appearance of the proposed structure. As you know, this is a very small lot. The size of the house is overwhelming!! In addition, I am asking that you be very cautious in approving the design. Our neighborhood is quite quaint and unique. Nothing in the neighborhood stands out as an anomaly. Also, there are several nearby homes that will need total remodeling in the near future. I would hate for this house to set an example and change the fabric of our neighborhood. Thank you

Nicholas Leonard and Kevin Leonard, Lowndes Properties Submitted Aug. 23, 2023 6:39 AM

We are the residents of 19 Lowndes Street. Our home is situated four (4) doors down from the proposed project at 11 Lowndes Street. We write to express our concerns regarding the project. To date, we have been provided with limited information regarding the proposal. However, after doing our due diligence, we have come to learn that the plans are large and do not seem to take into consideration the character of the neighboring homes and downtown Charleston as a whole.

As residents of historic homes, we pride ourselves in preserving the quintessential Charleston charm that South of Broad has so carefully cultivated over the last 100 years. While we understand that there is a time, place, and need for modernization, the BAR is here to ensure that new-builds enhance the allure of the neighborhood, not detract from it.

We are gravely concerned that the size, style, height, and scale of the proposed project at 11 Lowndes will undercut the careful preservation and planning efforts of our city and undermine decades of careful planning by the BAR. We kindly ask the members of the BAR to carefully consider whether the proposal is in consistent with its surroundings. We do not believe it is.

Notwithstanding the above, we have legitimate concerns for the structural and environmental impact a project of this nature would pose on our street namely: flooding, sunlight, and live oak tree preservation. Neighbors will bear the financial burden of remedying these issues for years to come. Water runoff—notably any hardscaping in the backyard and a lack of gutter systems that ensures 100% drainage to the street-- will cause holes in the neighboring homes where piers currently lay. Runoff will cause root rot to 150 year old live oak trees. We know this because we nearly bought 7 Lowndes Street but backed out of the deal out of concerns for the impact a new home on 11 Lowndes would have. 7 Lowndes, before the renovation by the current owners, was already experiencing significant water damage under the house caused by the soil's inability to drain and the natural grading of our street. Holes, of depths greater than 4 feet, developed under this home. Please remember that Lowndes Street homes are built on landfill. The size of the proposed project will permanently alter the grading of land and the directional flow of water on our street.

The movement of dirt of the property will redirect water onto neighboring properties, especially if any new dirt or sand is brought to the location. How is this fair to the neighbors who have spent millions of dollars purchasing and renovating their historically compliant homes?

Additionally, we are concerned that the proposed height of the new home is going to cause irreparable damage to the value of the surrounding homes. The height should not exceed the height of neighboring homes. The height, as currently proposed, will decimate the sunlight of nearby homes and the massive side windows will invade the privacy of abutting properties. Eliminating sunlight will amplify the humidity under the already shaded properties at 13 and 15 Lowndes. Added water as a result of hardscaping will further worsen the problem and may potentially cause structural damage to the homes.

Further, it is our understanding that the plans currently propose building extremely close to the lot line on all sides. We believe this is unacceptable as the size of the lot cannot adequately accommodate plans so large and contribute to our environmental concerns. The home at 11 Lowndes should be no wider, no larger, and no taller than 13 Lowndes street—which is appropriate for the size of the lot.

Allowing such a modern new build, and a home of this scale on such a small plot, would cause the BAR to lose legitimacy in the community. We are pleading with you to stand by your mission to "maintain historical and cultural heritage" and do the right thing.

We have personal experience in renovating a home with the BAR. When we proposed an all-glass backdoor to our home, the BAR rejected our plans as it felt it did not comply with the historic character of the home. We went through many iterations for a simple door and, in the end, appreciated the BAR's careful attention to preservation. We are asking you do the same to the plans at 11 Lowndes. It would be a shame to see the BAR give preferential treatment to projects with deep pockets and/or important names. We have no intention of making this issue more of public matter in downtown Charleston. However, if we see evidence of preferential treatment, we will unite and make this issue a citywide conversation.

We ask that you carefully consider whether the proposal in front of you is consistent with city values, the historic charm, and preservation efforts that is entrusted in the BAR. Specifically, we ask that the home eventually built at 11 Lowndes reflect the dimensions (height and depth) and specifications of the home at 13 Lowndes.

It is our hope that further iterations and proposals of this project will consider the integrity of the neighborhood and the impact on the surrounding homes. As such, we ask that you please reject these plans as drafted and request changes that actually consider the character of our beautiful city and propose a plan that Charleston, and the citizens of Charlestowne, can be proud of. We are a top tourist destination for a reason, let's not turn our city into Kowloon.

We will not hesitate to fight for what is right for our neighborhood and will enact all legal remedies.

8. 10 ½ Rutledge Avenue

TMS # 457-12-03-030 | BAR2023-001195

NS | Charlestowne | c. 1915 | Old and Historic District

Requesting hardscape replacement for driveway.

Owner: George & Suzy Scudder

Applicant: George Scudder

9. 20 Atlantic Street

TMS # 457-16-04-030 | BAR2023-001175

NS | Charlestowne | c. 1910 | Old and Historic District

Requesting preliminary approval for fenestration alterations.

Owner: Aaron Kirchner

Applicant: Evan Gonzalez, Beau Clowney Architects

10. 119 Coming Street

TMS # 460-16-03-031 | BAR2023-001172

Category 3 | Radcliffeborough | c. 1850 | Old and Historic District

Requesting conceptual approval for new accessory dwelling unit at rear.

Owner: Lowry & Connie Hughes

Applicant: Batton Kennon, Herlong Architects

Three (3) Comments Submitted:

Elizabeth Soule Brainard, Radcliffeborough Neighborhood Association

Submitted to Staff

See attached letter.

Ronald Hornbeck, 116-B Coming Street

Submitted to Staff

See attached letter.

• Kathryn Mallory, 115 Coming Street

Submitted to Staff

See attached letter.

11.4 Trumbo Street

TMS # 457-12-01-010 | BAR2023-001089

Category 4 | Harleston Village | c. 1870 | Old and Historic District

Request conceptual approval to elevate home above DFE, enclose portion of first floor porch, second floor addition, and new entry stair.

Owner: Charleston & Erica Missel
Applicant: Chatauk Studio, Jeremy Kruska



April 27, 2023 58 Warren Street Charleston SC 29403 RadcliffeboroughSC@gmail.com

Connie and Lowry Hughes 119 Coming Street Charleston SC 29403

Dear Connie and Lowry,

Thank you for attending the Radcliffeborough Neighborhood Association membership meeting on April 20, 2023. I appreciated your willingness to share your plans with the attendees. Although we did not have the opportunity to take a formal vote, neighbors seemed to be very supportive of your plans. Should you, your architect or the City need a formal vote, please let me know. But in our Board's mind, there has been no opposition from the neighbors.

Good luck with your building!

Sincerely.

Elizabeth Sovie Brainard

President

To whom it may concern:

Re: ADU at 119 Coming St., Charleston, SC 29403

The Hughes family is proposing to build an Accessory Dwelling Unit at 119 Coming St. They have discussed the project and shared the submittal plans with me. I have no objections and support the project.

Signature: <u>Panald Hornbeck</u>

Printed Name: <u>Ronald Hornbeck</u>

Address: <u>116-B Coming</u> 57.

Charles Hon, Sc 29403

To whom it may concern:

Re: ADU at 119 Coming St., Charleston, SC 29403

The Hughes family is proposing to build an Accessory Dwelling Unit at 119 Coming St. They have discussed the project and shared the submittal plans with us. We have no objections and support the project.

Signature: Kathryn Mallory
Address: 115 Coming Street